

Public Utility Law Project of New York, Inc., Case 15-E-0302
Projected Bill Impact of ZEC Subsidy on Residential Ratepayers
By Electric Utility Service Area, 2017 - 2029

Utility (1)	Number of Customers (2)	Average Usage In Kilowatt Hours (KWhrs)		Bill Impact on Residential Ratepayers			
		Annual (Utility) (3)	Monthly (Customer) (4)	Subsidy Per KWhr (5)	Average Customer Annually (6)	Total Service Area (\$ millions)	
						1 Year (7)	2 years (8)
Tranche 1 (04/17 - 03/19) Average/Total							
Central Hudson	213,187	1,685,000,000	659	\$0.003317	\$26.21	\$5.6	\$11.2
Con Edison	2,868,462	13,529,000,000	393	\$0.003317	\$15.64	\$44.9	\$89.7
Long Island Power Auth	1,002,942	9,611,000,000	799	\$0.003317	\$31.78	\$31.9	\$63.8
New York State Elec & Gas	763,590	6,678,000,000	729	\$0.003317	\$29.00	\$22.1	\$44.3
Niagara Mohawk	1,164,691	8,915,000,000	638	\$0.003317	\$25.39	\$29.6	\$59.1
Orange & Rockland	195,446	1,626,000,000	693	\$0.003317	\$27.59	\$5.4	\$10.8
Rochester Gas & Electric	331,367	2,653,000,000	667	\$0.003317	\$26.55	\$8.8	\$17.6
	6,539,685	44,697,000,000	570	\$0.003317	\$22.67	\$148.2	\$296.5
Tranche 2 (04/19 - 03/21) Average/Total							
Central Hudson	213,187	1,685,000,000	659	\$0.003712	\$29.34	\$6.3	\$12.5
Con Edison	2,868,462	13,529,000,000	393	\$0.003712	\$17.51	\$50.2	\$100.4
Long Island Power Auth	1,002,942	9,611,000,000	799	\$0.003712	\$35.57	\$35.7	\$71.4
New York State Elec & Gas	763,590	6,678,000,000	729	\$0.003712	\$32.46	\$24.8	\$49.6
Niagara Mohawk	1,164,691	8,915,000,000	638	\$0.003712	\$28.41	\$33.1	\$66.2
Orange & Rockland	195,446	1,626,000,000	693	\$0.003712	\$30.88	\$6.0	\$12.1
Rochester Gas & Electric	331,367	2,653,000,000	667	\$0.003712	\$29.72	\$9.8	\$19.7
	6,539,685	44,697,000,000	570	\$0.003712	\$25.37	\$165.9	\$331.8
Tranche 3 (04/21 - 03/23) Average/Total							
Central Hudson	213,187	1,685,000,000	659	\$0.004047	\$31.99	\$6.8	\$13.6
Con Edison	2,868,462	13,529,000,000	393	\$0.004047	\$19.09	\$54.8	\$109.5
Long Island Power Auth	1,002,942	9,611,000,000	799	\$0.004047	\$38.79	\$38.9	\$77.8
New York State Elec & Gas	763,590	6,678,000,000	729	\$0.004047	\$35.40	\$27.0	\$54.1
Niagara Mohawk	1,164,691	8,915,000,000	638	\$0.004047	\$30.98	\$36.1	\$72.2
Orange & Rockland	195,446	1,626,000,000	693	\$0.004047	\$33.67	\$6.6	\$13.2
Rochester Gas & Electric	331,367	2,653,000,000	667	\$0.004047	\$32.40	\$10.7	\$21.5
	6,539,685	44,697,000,000	570	\$0.004047	\$27.66	\$180.9	\$361.8
Tranche 4 (04/23 - 03/25) Average/Total							
Central Hudson	213,187	1,685,000,000	659	\$0.004507	\$35.62	\$7.6	\$15.2
Con Edison	2,868,462	13,529,000,000	393	\$0.004507	\$21.25	\$61.0	\$121.9
Long Island Power Auth	1,002,942	9,611,000,000	799	\$0.004507	\$43.19	\$43.3	\$86.6
New York State Elec & Gas	763,590	6,678,000,000	729	\$0.004507	\$39.41	\$30.1	\$60.2
Niagara Mohawk	1,164,691	8,915,000,000	638	\$0.004507	\$34.49	\$40.2	\$80.4
Orange & Rockland	195,446	1,626,000,000	693	\$0.004507	\$37.49	\$7.3	\$14.7
Rochester Gas & Electric	331,367	2,653,000,000	667	\$0.004507	\$36.08	\$12.0	\$23.9
	6,539,685	44,697,000,000	570	\$0.004507	\$30.80	\$201.4	\$402.9

Public Utility Law Project of New York, Inc., Case 15-E-0302
Projected Bill Impact of ZEC Subsidy on Residential Ratepayers
By Electric Utility Service Area, 2017 - 2029

Utility (1)	Number of Customers (2)	Average Usage In Kilowatt Hours (KWhrs)		Bill Impact on Residential Ratepayers			
		Annual (Utility) (3)	Monthly (Customer) (4)	Subsidy Per KWhr (5)	Average Customer Annually (6)	Total Service Area (\$ millions)	
						1 Year (7)	2 years (8)
Tranche 5 (04/25 - 03/27) Average/Total							
Central Hudson	213,187	1,685,000,000	659	\$0.004998	\$39.50	\$8.4	\$16.8
Con Edison	2,868,462	13,529,000,000	393	\$0.004998	\$23.57	\$67.6	\$135.2
Long Island Power Auth	1,002,942	9,611,000,000	799	\$0.004998	\$47.89	\$48.0	\$96.1
New York State Elec & Gas	763,590	6,678,000,000	729	\$0.004998	\$43.71	\$33.4	\$66.7
Niagara Mohawk	1,164,691	8,915,000,000	638	\$0.004998	\$38.25	\$44.6	\$89.1
Orange & Rockland	195,446	1,626,000,000	693	\$0.004998	\$41.58	\$8.1	\$16.3
Rochester Gas & Electric	331,367	2,653,000,000	667	\$0.004998	\$40.01	\$13.3	\$26.5
	6,539,685	44,697,000,000	570	\$0.004998	\$34.16	\$223.4	\$446.7
Tranche 6 (04/27 - 03/29) Average/Total							
Central Hudson	213,187	1,685,000,000	659	\$0.005504	\$43.50	\$9.3	\$18.5
Con Edison	2,868,462	13,529,000,000	393	\$0.005504	\$25.96	\$74.5	\$148.9
Long Island Power Auth	1,002,942	9,611,000,000	799	\$0.005504	\$52.74	\$52.9	\$105.8
New York State Elec & Gas	763,590	6,678,000,000	729	\$0.005504	\$48.13	\$36.8	\$73.5
Niagara Mohawk	1,164,691	8,915,000,000	638	\$0.005504	\$42.13	\$49.1	\$98.1
Orange & Rockland	195,446	1,626,000,000	693	\$0.005504	\$45.79	\$8.9	\$17.9
Rochester Gas & Electric	331,367	2,653,000,000	667	\$0.005504	\$44.06	\$14.6	\$29.2
	6,539,685	44,697,000,000	570	\$0.005504	\$37.62	\$246.0	\$492.0
All Tranches (04/17 - 03/29) Average/Total							
Central Hudson	213,187	1,685,000,000	659	\$0.004347	\$34.36	\$7.3	\$87.9
Con Edison	2,868,462	13,529,000,000	393	\$0.004347	\$20.50	\$58.8	\$705.8
Long Island Power Auth	1,002,942	9,611,000,000	799	\$0.004347	\$41.66	\$41.8	\$501.4
New York State Elec & Gas	763,590	6,678,000,000	729	\$0.004347	\$38.02	\$29.0	\$348.4
Niagara Mohawk	1,164,691	8,915,000,000	638	\$0.004347	\$33.28	\$38.8	\$465.1
Orange & Rockland	195,446	1,626,000,000	693	\$0.004347	\$36.17	\$7.1	\$84.8
Rochester Gas & Electric	331,367	2,653,000,000	667	\$0.004347	\$34.80	\$11.5	\$138.4
	6,539,685	44,697,000,000	570	\$0.004347	\$29.71	\$194.3	\$2,331.7

Column Notes

(1) Electric utilities include the 6 investor owned utilities plus the Long Island Power Authority (LIPA, administered by PSEG Long Island).

Public Utility Law Project of New York, Inc., Case 15-E-0302
Projected Bill Impact of ZEC Subsidy on Residential Ratepayers
By Electric Utility Service Area, 2017 - 2029

(2) Number of customers as reported by the NYS Public Service Commission in its 45th Annual Edition of the Financial Statistics of the Major Investor Owned Utilities in New York State (5 Year Book), available at: [http://www3.dps.ny.gov/W/PSCWeb.nsf/96f0fec0b45a3c6485257688006a701a/9cbdfd5cfb8664af85257f630061c8f1/\\$FILE/annual%20bill%202014.pdf](http://www3.dps.ny.gov/W/PSCWeb.nsf/96f0fec0b45a3c6485257688006a701a/9cbdfd5cfb8664af85257f630061c8f1/$FILE/annual%20bill%202014.pdf), and the Long Island Power Authority in its 2015 Annual Report, available at: http://www.lipower.org/pdfs/company/2015_CEO_Letter_and_Annual_Report.pdf.

(3) PSC 5 Year Book, LIPA 2015 Annual Report. Usage totals for the combined residential, commercial, industrial and other classes from the PSC five year book equals 93,982,000,000 KWhrs. LIPA usage from the 2015 Annual report equals 20,785,000,000 KWhrs. The total of these two sources is 114,767,000,000 KWhrs - 70,070,000,000 KWhrs, or 61%, of which is non-residential. Additionally, another 32,604,913,000 KWhrs of non-residential usage is reported by the EIA, bringing total New York State usage to 147,371,913,000 KWhrs per the EIA as reflected in Column **(7)** on Projected Cost of ZEC Subsidy, 2017 - 2029. The difference of 32,604,913,000 KWhrs appears to be the result of New York Power Authority (NYPA), municipal electric system, and other entity sales of electricity not included in the PSC 5 Year Book. Taken together, non-residential usage rises to 102,674,913 KWhrs, or 70% of total New York State usage.

Non-residential usage, including NYPA and municipal electric system sales, are subject to the ZEC cost recovery mechanism described in the Order Adopting a Clean Energy Standard, Case 15-E-0302. Should any of the sales attributable to NYPA, municipal electric systems, or any other entities making up the 53-63% of total state usage become exempt from ZEC cost recovery mechanism, the share of ZEC cost recovery born by residential ratepayers would increase. Such an increase could be material, given the sizeable share of the subsidy now expected to be born by non-residential ratepayers.

- (4)** Column **(3)** divided by Column **(2)**.
- (5)** Cost / KWhr from Projected Cost of ZEC Subsidy, 2017 - 2029, Column **(8)**.
- (6)** Column **(4)** times Column **(5)** times **12**.
- (7)** Column **(2)** times Column **(6)**.
- (8)** Column **(7)** times 2.